



INFLUENCE OF RELIABILITY AND RESPONSIVENESS TO SERVICE QUALITY ON COMMUTERS' SATISFACTION IN A ROAD TRANSPORTATION FIRMS IN ANAMBRA STATE, NIGERIA.

Chukwudi Ikemefuna Njelita

Department of Entrepreneurship, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka

Email: ci.njelita@unizik.edu.ng ; Phone:+2340 8063 842 567

Promise Chika Opara

Department of Marketing, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka

ABSTRACT

This work examined the influence of reliability and responsiveness to service quality on commuter satisfaction among road transportation firms in Anambra state. The study examined the influence the reliability and responsiveness variables of service quality on commuters' satisfaction. The study used questionnaire as survey instrument to collect the primary data. The study is anchored on the Gap theory of service quality that apply servqual model. The population of the study consists of three hundred and twenty seven (327) respondents who are the commuters of the five (5) selected transport companies in Anambra state. Pearson's correlation was employed to determine the extent of association between the variables used in the study. Furthermore, linear regressions was conducted to test the hypotheses using the statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) version 21. The results of the study showed that service quality variables (reliability, responsiveness) have significant positive influence on commuter satisfaction. The study recommends that the servqual model of service quality as adapted model be used in transport sector as to improve the service quality offered to commuters. There is need to organize more training of employees in the transport companies to increase their customer service and customer management skills. The use of modern transport management computer applications in ticketing is recommended to reward responsively loyal commuters that will also increase commuter satisfaction and reliable commuter retention.

Keywords: service quality, reliability, responsiveness, commuter satisfaction, commuters.

Introduction

Transportation is the movement of goods, persons, animals, from one place to another through land, water, air, and space and the various means by which such movement is accomplished Globally, transportation is an essential asset in any economy. Public services, such as public transportation, have to meet the needs of the people while playing a role in economic and urban sustainability. The government over time has not managed their transport firms effectively and



efficiently and this has resulted to commuters abandoned at the mercy of the freelance private transport owners that dominate the road transport network all over the state (Okakunori, 2006). In Nigeria, the commonest means of transportation is land transport and, road transport is the dominant means of transportation used to move persons and goods from one place to another. Rail system is not yet evident in Anambra state, Nigeria. In road transport, majority of the firms that offer transport services are privately owned as such they determine the quality of service offered to commuters (Ejem, 2021). The transport firms in this industry have already realized that they operate in a competitive environment, competing for customers as well as for resources. In service delivery, quality is only obtained when the customer's needs and wants are satisfied or exceeded. Hence firms in the transport sector seem to be upgrading the passenger's relevance for their line of business (Madumere, Uche & Agu, 2020).

In Anambra state, there are organised transport firms and freelance transporters that operate in the state. The organised transport firms have fleet of vehicles that ply the firms route of interest and have a fixed terminal where commuters converge to pay in order to be transported to their destination. Service quality therefore, provides seamless relationship between customers and the organization and it is a two-way flow of value. This means that customers derive certain value from the relationship which translates into value for the organization in the form of enhanced profitability and satisfaction over a long period of time (Ojo, 2010). The concept of customer satisfaction is built up by customer experiences, how they perceive the service they are offered and ultimately by whether they actually are satisfied with their experiences or not. One way of competing more successfully today is by offering true customer service and service quality (Wilson, Zeithaml, Bitner & Gremier 2008).

The commuters who travel from one place to another expect to enjoy certain level of satisfaction in the services offered. Since service is intangible and consumed as it is produced, However, in transportation industry, one of the most important challenges is whether management can perceive correctly what passengers want and expect. Moreover, in evaluating service quality in this industry, passengers compare how they perceive the service with their expectations. Thus, assessing passenger expectations in this industry; is an inevitable exercise, because commuters are becoming increasingly sensitive to quality service. Therefore, this work will examine the influence that service quality dimensions of reliability and responsiveness



have on commuter satisfaction in selected transportation firms in Awka, Ekwulobia, Onitsha, and Nnewi cities of Anambra State..

Statement of the Problem

The provision of adequate and appropriate road transportation services, to move commuters from one place to another is a major challenge encountered in almost all cities in Anambra State. The increasing number of residents in the cities, urban and semi-urban areas has also brought about increased number of commercial vehicles that offer transportation services. Commuters move from their homes to place of work or business and vice versa to perform their businesses for the day. It was observed that commuters patronize free-lance buses in their large numbers irrespective of services offered by organized transportation firms. These services include, shelter to protect them against sun and rain, waiting bench, proper harmonized ticketing and identifiable drivers.

Research by Taran, (2022), showed that commuters were unsatisfied with the quality of service by shuttle transport service in Jordan. Madumere, Uche, & Agu (2020) research in South east Nigeria revealed that what looks like satisfaction in most organized road transport firms is not a function of high service quality delivery and performance but a function of other factors such as nearness of terminals to customers point of take-off or destination, cost and unavailability of alternative transport service providers, given the difficulty in finding an operator that is really service quality conscious. These conflicting findings from the previous studies show that the relationship between service qualities and consumer satisfaction are not yet resolved. This research will examine the influence the service quality parameters; responsiveness, and reliability has on commuters' satisfaction by studying the road transport firms in Anambra state and to fill the gap in knowledge.

Objectives of the Study

1. Determine the influence of reliability on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra state.
2. Establish the influence of responsiveness on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra state.

Research Questions



The following research questions will guide this study.

1. How significant is the effect of reliability on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firm in Anambra state?
2. How significant is the effect of responsiveness on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra state?

Theory and Hypotheses

Conceptual Framework

Service Quality: Service is valued "acts, deeds, or performance" done unto the customers the prime can be defended as essentially intangible (Loverlock, Vandermerwe, Lewis, & Fernie 2011). Service is an economic activity that provides benefit and creates value at specific times and places to the customers (Vargo & Lusch, 2008). Goldstein, Johnston, Duffy & Raod (2002) mentioned that while the people, technology, physical facilities and equipment in the service constitute input of service, service outcomes and experiences constitute output of services. In addition, well-designed inputs will bring the quality to the company. Kotler, Wong, Saunders and Armstrong (2005) defined service as an activity benefit that one party can offer to another that is essentially tangible and does not result in the warship of anything. The intangibility of service can be seen in its "experience", "time", and "process". The problem of that characteristic is the difficulties for setting the price for service marketers. So, for many authors, the critical distinction stems from service being intangible, Customers generally are not able to perceive the service before being consumed. They can only perceive the service after consumption. This is a challenge for customer satisfaction and service providers and the need to position service to be tangible (Mudie & Pirrie 2006). Scholars have defined quality in three distinct ways: quality as excellence, quality as value and quality as meeting or exceeding expectations (Ekinici, Dawes, Massey 2008). Service quality has been conceptualized as "the difference between customer expectations regarding a service to be received and satisfactions of the service being received" (Akbar & Parvez, 2009).

Service Quality Variables of Interest



SERVQUAL, developed by scholars from the North American school of thought is the best known customer-oriented model used to measure service quality (Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry, 1991). Service quality measures the gap between customer expectations and their satisfactions of the actual experience on a five dimensional scale; tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, empathy, assurance. According to Parasuraman et al (1985), the appearances of a gap can be influenced by ten factors. They include: competence, courtesy, credibility, security, and accessibility, communication, knowing the customers, tangibles, reliability and responsiveness. These ten faces were later reduced to five that include reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy and tangibles based on these five factors, the 22- item SERVQUAL item was developed. According to Juran (1989) measurement of quality in a service organization was classified along two dimensions internal and external. Internal measurement is to measure the internal process while external measurement is to measure the quality of products or services based on customer satisfaction. The main yardstick of performance in quality for service organizations is external customers' satisfaction. However, these dimensions have shown to be indistinct and other models of service quality have shown to be more agreeable (Carmen, 1990). Moreover, new dimensions have been found while applying the SERVQUAL model in diverse industries. The Sequel dimensions of reliability and responsiveness are germane to the current study

Reliability Construct

According to Lee et al (2009), reliability is the service company ability to deliver promises on time Reliability involves the ability to perform the promised service dependably and accurately. In other words, reliability is the ability to perform the promised service dependably and accurately, reliability involves in consistency of performance and dependability. It means that the firm performs the service right the first time. It also means that the firm fulfils its promises. Reliability of service designates the seller's capability to supply the promised outputs at the stated level. Reliability is about the organization keeping its word. It is defined as "the ability to perform the promised service dependably and accurately" or delivering on its promises". Bloise and Tankersley (2004) believe that providing a service and meeting commitments on time according to the promised service date in a professional manner will influence a customer's satisfaction in a special way. The employees at the institution should ensure that the



desired service level is performed at the first time correctly. This implies that the organization keeps its promises within the specific time frame set out.

Jaiswal (2008) believes that reliability is the most important dimension of service quality. Reliability improvements are at the heart of service quality enhancement efforts because unreliable service means promises not being met on the attributes that customers care about the service received. If the main service is not performed reliably, customers may assume that the company is incompetent and may switch to another organization. This variable is critical as all commuters want to deal with firms that keep their promises and this is generally implicitly communicated to the firm's customers.

Responsiveness construct

Responsiveness is the degree to which customers perceive service providers' readiness to assist them promptly. Responsiveness involves the willingness to help customers. Lee et al (2009) maintain that responsiveness is the willingness to help customers and provide prompt service, responsiveness concerns the willingness or readiness of employees to provide service. It involves timeliness of service. Responsiveness refers to the corporation's capability to respond to and satisfy the customer's wishes. A willingness to react and reaction speed play a vital role in the service responsiveness. Responsiveness is the willingness to help customers and provide prompt services. This dimension is concerned with dealing with customer's requests, questions and complaints promptly and attentively. A firm is known to be responsive if it takes time to communicate to its clients how long it would take to get answers or have their problems dealt with (Har, 2008).

Dale (2003) defines responsiveness as the willingness to assist customers and to provide prompt on a continuous as Responsiveness is linked to the time period that customers have wait for help, receive answers to queries or attention to problems as well as the ability to develop customised solutions for customers. Bloise and Tankersley (2004) contend that, whether the intention occurs face to face or telephonically, the degree to which the service personnel exhibit the ability to handle such matters effectively, and whether they care about attending to the customer's request, will undoubtedly impact on satisfactions of service quality. This dimension is concerned with dealing with the customer's requests, questions and complaints promptly and attentively. A firm is known to be responsive when it communicates



to its customers how long it would take to get answers or have their problems dealt with. To be successful, companies need to look at responsiveness from the viewpoint of the customer rather than the company's perspective (Zeithaml et al., 2006).

Consumer satisfaction

Consumer satisfaction is a marketing concept that encompasses a customer's impression, awareness and/or consciousness about a company or its offerings (Business Dictionary, 2020). Consumer satisfaction is influenced by a variety of factors. Besides the actual outcome for instance, did the product or service deliver the expected function and did it fulfill the customers need-the whole process of consumption and all interactions involved are of crucial importance. Ghazal and Suchita (2014) see consumer satisfaction as the customer judgment of the overall excellence of the service provided in relation to the quality that was expected.

Consumer satisfaction refers to the process by which a customer selects, organizes, and interprets information/stimuli inputs to create a meaningful picture of the brand or the product. It is a three stage process that translates raw stimuli into meaningful information. Each individual interprets the meaning of stimulus in a manner consistent with his/her own unique biases, needs and expectations. Three stages of satisfaction are exposure, attention and interpretation (Habibollah, Younes and Ahmad, 2016).

Different consumers may perceive one and the same product or service in different ways. A customer's satisfaction of an offering may even deviate from what the product or service provider or marketer had intended. This may give serious problems in today's attention economy. Everybody is exposed to more and more diverse information than ever before. It is hard enough for an offering to get a potential customer's attention at all. If the customer's satisfaction of this offering is an unfavorable one, it probably will not get a second chance to make a better impression (Dagmar, 2017).

Consumer satisfaction is dynamic. First of all, with the developing relationship between customer and company, his satisfactions of the company and its products or services will change. The more experience the customer accumulates, the more his satisfactions will shift from fact-based judgments to a more general meaning the whole relationship gains for him.



Over time, he puts a stronger focus on the consequence of the product or service consumption (Dagmar, 2017). Consumer satisfaction of service quality is a comprehensive assessment of a service's benefits. There are two main factors that affect the quality of services, namely: expected service and perceived service. Kotler (2003) explained that the quality should start from the needs of customers (expectations) and ends at the customer's satisfaction. This means that good quality satisfaction is not based on the service provider, a band on the point of view or satisfaction of the customer.

Ghobadian, Speller, & Jones (1994) showed that organizations with perceived high quality services usually have higher market share and higher profitability than companies with perceived less quality. Zeithaml & Hier (2001) discussed customers' satisfaction or dissatisfaction as a response to the evaluation of the perceived discrepancy between expectations and service performance. They argued that satisfaction is considered to have a broad concept than service quality. They claimed that quality of service is the focus of the assessment that reflects the customers' satisfaction of the five specific dimensions of quality service.

Customer's expectation of a particular service is determined by factors such as recommendations, personal needs and past experiences. The expected service and the perceived service might not be equal thus leaving a gap, the difference, imbalance or disparity exists between customer's satisfaction of firms' performance and their prior expectation. Management of service quality largely focuses on managing the gaps between expectations and satisfactions of customer's (Zeithaml et al, 2003). The goal of the firm is to minimize the gap between satisfaction and expectation. Satisfactions of transport service quality are the degree to which passengers find various transportation attributes important in enhancing their satisfaction during their travel experience.

Theoretical Framework

This research work is anchored on SERVQUAL model. The original conceptualization of service quality was framework developed by Parasuraman et al (1985, 1988). Their works led to the development of a 22-item scale, the SERVQUAL instrument which has been used extensively by most researchers. The SERVQUAL instruments was originally measured on ten (10) aspects or dimensions of service quality: reliability, responsiveness, competence, access



courtesy, communication, credibility, security, understanding, and tangibles as a means of measuring the gap between customer expectation and experience.

The original construct was found to be overly complex, subjective and statistically unreliable as a result it was simplified and modified to the five dimensional models which is measured on five (5) aspects, namely reliability, assurance, tangibility, empathy and responsiveness Parasuraman et al (1991). SERVQUAL is a service quality framework that highlights five important business parameters customers use to analyze strength or weaknesses. SERVQUAL model assumes that customers evaluate a firm's service quality by comparing their satisfactions with their expectations. It highlights the five area of a business: Reliability, Assurance, Tangibles, Empathy, and Responsiveness, Gap analysis of SERVQUAL results measures the difference between satisfaction and expectation. This model allows businesses to improve an individual service variable by analyzing customer data. Service quality is therefore a function of pre-purchase customers' expectations, perceived process quality and perceived output quality (McCabe et al, 2007). Parasuraman et al (1985), conceptualized service quality as the gap between customers' expectation and their satisfaction of the service experience. Based on their conceptualization of service quality, the original instrument was made up of 22-items. Nyeck, Morales, Ladhari, & Pons, (2002) grouped the data on these items under the five dimensions of SERVQUAL. The SERVQUAL has proved to be an invaluable tool for service organizations to better understand what their customers or clients value and how well they are meeting the needs and expectations of customers and clients. It provides a benchmark based on customer opinions of an excellent organization, on the ranking of key attributes and on comparison to what employees of service organizations believe customers feel.

Criticisms of the SERVQUAL Theoretical framework

The SERVQUAL has come under some criticisms. Francis Buttle has criticized the SERVQUAL on a number of theoretical and operational bases. He noted that the five dimensions of SERVQUAL are not universals and that the model fails to draw on established economic, statistical and psychological theory (Buttle, 1996). But SERVQUAL has been used to measure - service quality in a variety of contexts. The wide array of application of such an instrument as SERVQUAL spells confidence in its utilization as a technique for measuring



service quality in various business sectors and service industries to their arguments in support of the SERVQUAL. Nyeck et al (2002), and Eboli, (2021) posit that SERVQUAL remains the most complete attempt to conceptualize and measure service quality. They contend that its main benefit is the ability of researchers to examine numerous service industries such as healthcare, banking, financial services and education. The fact that SERVQUAL has critics does not render it moot. Rather the criticisms may well have to do with how researchers use the tool, hence, the decision to use it as the model framework for the study. The researcher therefore propose to use the adapted two factor model of SERVQUAL (reliability and responsiveness) for this work

Theoretical Exposition

Reliability and Consumer Satisfaction

In the literature, service quality is measured primarily from the customer's perspective since customers are the sole judges of service quality (Ona et al, 2012). However, the use of a more objective measurement provided by the firm can be useful in improving comprehensive service quality. Reliability means ability to perform the promised service dependably and accurately, reliability involves in consistency of performance and dependability. It means that the firm performs the service right the first time. It also means that the firm honors its promises. Reliability is about the organization keeping its word. It is defined as "the ability to perform the promised service dependably and accurately" or delivering on its promises" (Zeithaml et al. 2006). Reliability of service designates the seller's capability to supply the promised outputs at the stated level (Blery et al., 2009). Reliability refers to the ability to perform promised services at the promised time, accurately, and dependably (Arizon, 2010). This means that services should be available as soon as customers expect to get the service, thus transporters should not misuse the information and there should be frequent update of new technologies. Customers want trustable services on which they can rely on.

In transport industry, service quality is one of the most important aspects of the premium customer experience. Reliability depends on handling customer service issues, performs the services right the first time, offers services on time, and maintain a record of error-free. Moreover, they define reliability as the most significant factor in conventional service



(Parasuraman et al. 1988). Although the service itself adds value, the enhancement of customer-perceived value relies on the firm actively communicating customer advocacy capabilities to the customers by promoting customer trust and satisfaction (Yeh, 2013). Firms focus on gathering extensive data about their customers, and then use the information to segment and personalize their offerings and marketing communications. We believe that service firms facilitate the creation and sharing of knowledge, competencies, and practices through open-mindedness to shape customer advocacy. Furthermore, the level of previous customer experience with certain services by other firms can impact on customers' satisfaction of service quality. Based on the foregoing, this study will determine whether customer satisfaction of service quality will depend on consistency of performance and dependability of services rendered by the transport companies.

Responsiveness and Commuter satisfaction

Responsiveness is the willingness to help customers and provide prompt services. This dimension is concerned with dealing with customer's requests, questions and complaints promptly and attentively. A firm is known to be responsive if it takes time to communicate to its clients how long it would take to get answers or have their problems dealt with (Har, 2008). It involves timeliness of service. Responsiveness refers to the corporation's capability to respond to and satisfy the customer's wishes. A willingness to react and reaction speed play a vital role in the service responsiveness (Arizon, 2010). It can be measured by the amount of time needed to deal with customers' reported problems and the response duration once the customer filed a service request (Santhiyavalli, 2011). Today, the quality of goods and services perceived by customers are highly important, it has become an obligation for firms to supply quality goods and services into the market. So it is necessary to follow customers' expectations closely and promptly take the essential steps to meet those (Cirpin & Sarica, 2014). In addition, the customer is the center of attention and customer service is the distinguishing factor (Jham & Khan, 2008) Service quality has been recognized as an important factor in improving customer satisfaction Responsiveness is the willingness to help customers and provide prompt service. Iglesias and Guillén (2004) asserted that responsiveness ensures speed and timeliness of service delivery. This consists of processing speed and service capabilities to respond promptly to customer service requests and wait a short and queuing time.



Because service delivery occurs during the interactions between contact employees and customers, attitudes and behaviors of the contact employees can influence customers' satisfactions of service quality (Schneider and Bowen, 1985). Moreover, Beatson, Lings, & Gudergan (2008), found that perceived employee satisfaction, perceived employee loyalty, and perceived employee commitment had a sizable impact on perceived product quality and on perceived service quality. Zeithaml and Bitner (1996) noted that contact employees represent the organization and can directly influence customer satisfaction; they perform the role of marketers. Whether acknowledged or not, service employees perform marketing functions. They can perform these functions well, to the organization's advantage, or poorly, to the organization's detriment. According to Bettencourt and Gwinner (1996) front line employee has the opportunity to tailor in real-time not only the services the firm offers, but also the way in which those services are delivered. Customer actions, reactions and other characteristics can have a profound influence on the actions and mannerisms of front-line service personnel. Customers largely establish their impressions of the organization's level of service provision based on their encounters with front line employee. Therefore, employees involved in the delivery of front-line services can provide valuable information for improving service. FLE are knowledgeable about the strengths and weaknesses of the service through their contact with customers and this is an important form of feedback that can be used by organizations in decision-making to better serve customers. Research has established a positive correlation between the attitudes of employees and those of customers, including employee and customer satisfactions of service quality (Schneider and Bowen, 1985).

Chen and Chang (2005) investigated the quality service provided by the Taiwanese airline. The result of the study showed that consumers were concerned with the responsiveness of ground personal, assurance and responsiveness are valued very high in in-flight service, while seat comfort has the highest priority for improvement. Similarly, Pakdil and Aydin in (2007) investigated the expectations and satisfactions of customers of a Turkish airline. They found that responsiveness is the most important dimension for airline consumers, while availability is the least important dimension. Based on the foregoing, this study will determine whether customer satisfaction of service quality in transport sector will depend on the willingness or reactions of employees namely drivers, loaders, conductors and ticket sellers to provide service to passengers.



Empirical Review

Service quality and commuter satisfaction have attracted much scholarly attention. For instance, Husin (2022) carried out a study on Factors that Influence Passenger Experience on Ride-Hailing Transportation among Young Generation. The study examined the relationship between tangibility, reliability, responsiveness, assurance and passenger experience on ride-hailing transportation among students of Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM). A total of 271 respondents participated in this study. The data were collected by online survey which was conducted through questionnaire and distributed using Google Form. This study analyzed by descriptive analysis, normality test, reliability analysis, Pearson correlation analysis, multiple regression analysis and hypothesis testing by using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). The survey results show that there is relationship between tangibility, reliability, responsiveness, assurance with passenger experience. Ride-hailing companies or service providers need to improve their service quality to provide passengers with a good experience, in order to attract and retain passengers.

Muthupandian and Vijayakumar (2012) used the SERVQUAL instrument to measure the quality in transportation services used in the State Road Transport Undertakings (SRTU) in Tamil Nadu, India. They took the five original criteria into consideration for evaluation each expectation and satisfaction. Gap 5 developed by Parasuraman et al., (1985) was considered to match if company provides high-quality service. In the end they saw there is no significant difference between satisfaction and expectation. For expectations lowest dimension was "tangibles", while the highest was "assurance", on the other hand, highest dimension for satisfactions was responsiveness while the lowest empathy.

Luke and Heyn (2020) measured the service quality of the majority of public transport modes by comparing commuter's perceptions of the current service levels with their expectations to determine service gaps where interventions are required. The results reflect that safety concerns, particularly regarding protection from crime, and maintenance, particularly as it affects the reliability of the service are concerns across most modes of transport. Although commuters regard the services as relatively affordable, this is insufficient to attract customers and reduce car ownership aspirations. Concerns related to addressing the mobility and accessibility needs of commuters in the off-peak, keeping commuters informed and training



staff to be willing to assist passengers are likely to impact the willingness to remain on public transport and even attract new users.

Taran, (2022). This paper mainly adopts descriptive analysis method and case study method and uses SERVQUAL model and statistical method to measure and evaluate the service quality level of shuttle bus of Al al-Bayt University. The study concluded that the order of the dimensions of measuring the quality of shuttle service was as follows: assurance, reliability, and empathy at a medium level; then tangibility followed by responsiveness at a low level for each. In general, the students' satisfaction level with the shuttle services provided at the campus was low, especially for the tangibility and responsiveness dimensions. This research is of value to transport service providers in understanding the gaps in and requirements of their service provision. To policy makers it highlights the dissatisfaction in the current levels of public transport service, as well as providing some indication of areas in which future interventions can be directed.

Banerjee, Saha, Jain, & Rao (2020) measured service quality as proposed by (Parasuraman, Zeithaml, Berry, 1988) and its impact on satisfaction for on-demand ride services. The data was collected from around 1494 respondents using any on-demand ride mobile application for at least six months. The initial questionnaire was pre-tested with around 50 on-demand ride mobile application users. The changes were incorporated in the finalized questionnaire before starting the data collection. It was found that for delivering satisfaction to the on-demand ride users all the dimensions are service quality namely reliability, assurance, empathy and responsiveness are significant, though for measuring service quality all the five measures are essential.

Agyeman , & Cheng (2020). The quality of bus transport to school and its synergistic effects on school attendance, quality teaching, and learning are best measured using experiences and perceptions of users. The study sought to investigate 43 obstacles to the delivery of quality bus service via 20 selected private schools in the Sunyani Municipality, Ghana. The survey was an exploratory case study which focused on the use of a questionnaire. Survey participants of 403 students were selected to respond, using the probability sampling technique. Descriptive statistics were used to define essential socio-demographic and bus service-related characteristics and their effects on schoolchildren's mobility decision-making as well as



academic work. Exploratory factor analysis was used to construct four latent factors which describe obstacles to perceived service quality (PSQ) delivery. The theoretical factor structure of the data was tested using confirmatory factor analysis in AMOSS 23. Simultaneously, path analysis was employed to investigate the direct and indirect effects of barriers to PSQ in the private schools' transport system. The principal component analysis highlighted four constructs as barriers to bus PSQ in the municipality: (1) perceived scheduling and routing barriers, (2) perceived safety and bus attribute barriers, (3) pedestrian and bus stop facilities barriers and (4) efficiency, effectiveness, and equity-related barriers. We recommend that Private School Authorities and Municipal Board of Education adopt policies and draft operational safety and guideline manuals that clarify acceptable bus service delivery benchmarks and performance indicators for schools.

Zorgati , Zorgati and Zaabi (2021) worked on Public transportation and service quality management during the COVID-19 outbreak. This study aims to investigate the quality management of public transportation services in the Tunisian context during the COVID-19 outbreak. The empirical study was based on the conjoint analysis approach. The sample collected is composed of 250 individuals who often use the train as a means of transport and the pair-wise comparison method is adopted for conjoint analysis. This study assesses quality management of customer service and takes into account four aspects of service quality such as comfort, way of reservation (possibility of online booking), speed, and safety. The findings revealed that the optimal combination of service offered by the Tunisian national railway company is characterized by the terms “first class”, “online booking”, “express”, and “safety”. It is favored by Tunisian customers during the COVID-19 outbreak. Additionally, the results show that the maximum utility corresponds to the “safety train” modality followed by “second class”, “online booking”, and finally “stopover”. Moreover, the use of new information and communication technologies (NICT) has importance for train users during the COVID-19 outbreak. Indeed, Tunisians are looking for safety and measures to reduce crowding in a train, to minimize the risk of contagion of COVID-19 outbreak.

Etuk , Anyadighibe , James , and Mbaka (2021). This study examined service quality and passengers' loyalty of public transportation companies. It was carried out to determine the effects of passengers' safety, passengers' comfort, drivers' competence, travel time and vehicle cleanliness on passengers' loyalty of public transportation companies. The study adopted cross-



sectional survey research design. Primary data were obtained from 228 passengers of public road transportation companies using an adapted structured questionnaire. Data analysis was done using descriptive statistics while multiple linear regression was adopted to test the hypotheses of the study with the aid of the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS 23) software. The findings of the study revealed that passengers' safety, passengers' comfort, drivers' competence and vehicle cleanliness had significant positive effects on passengers' loyalty of public transportation companies, while travel time had a non-significant effect on passengers' loyalty in this regard. Therefore, the study concluded that, to a large extent, service quality has a significant positive influence on passengers' loyalty of public transportation companies. Practical implications and suggestions for further studies were made consequently.

Helon & Ejem, (2021) examined road transport management and customers' satisfaction in Nigeria using SERVQUAL Model with focus on Imo Transport Company. Nigeria. The study used primary data collected through questionnaire as survey instrument to elicit the service quality satisfactions of road passengers. The results of the study indicated that the six SERVQUAL dimension showed that there is a strong relationship between customers' satisfaction and public transport service in Nigeria. Thus, from perspectives of the passengers, road transportation and customer's satisfaction is very essential for the movement of goods and people. Based on the finding, the study recommended regular maintenance of vehicles and roads and provision of quality customer services that will satisfy the commuters who constantly use the roads must be put in place in order to achieve customers' satisfaction and thus improve economic activities.

Nurmahdi (2019). Marketing activities through e-marketing and mobile marketing technology operated by online taxi players, such as, Grab and Uber have an impact on the transportation sector, especially operators which serve the Greater Jakarta / Jabodetabek (Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang and Bekasi) area to and from Soekarno Hatta International Airport (SHIA). Operators were worried that the advancement of online taxis could ruin their market share. Thus, customer insight information is needed. Exploratory research which measures customers' perception and focuses on Product Quality and ServQual was applied in this research. Non-probability, purposive sampling was used, with 134 loyal bus customers were chosen. These matched the criteria of having travelled the specified route at least five times within the last 12 months. Importance Performance Analysis (IPA), which measures the



relationship between customer perception and priority on increasing product or service quality, was applied. IPA combines the measurements of importance (degree of care) and performance (degree of satisfaction) in two dimensions which would make it easier to explain and describe practical suggestions. Customer Satisfaction Index (CSI) was applied and scored 75.05 which means that customers were satisfied. This was derived from the overall weighted score of five Servqual dimensions: tangibles, assurance, reliability, responsiveness, and empathy. This study concluded that even though the CSI result was satisfactory, to defend and enhance the market share, new innovative marketing strategies were needed, including the introduction of new technology in marketing and operations, in order to increase the overall quality of services to customers.

Research Hypotheses

The following research questions will guide this study.

- Ho: Reliability has no significant effect on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra state.
- H₁: Reliability has significant effect on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra state.
- Ho₂: Responsiveness has no significant effect on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra state.
- H₂: Responsiveness has significant effect on commuters' satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra state.

METHOD

Research Design

The study adopted a purely descriptive research approach as it sought to establish the relationship between variables. Descriptive research involves collecting data in order to test hypotheses or answer research questions concerning the current status of the subject of the study. Thus this approach will be adopted because it seeks to describe the situation as it was with regards service quality and customer satisfaction.



Research Instrument

The researcher used questionnaire to generate the primary data needed for the study. The questionnaire contains efficient questions for collection of relevant information required to achieve the purpose of the study. Questions were organized on issue-based structured patterns following the sub-elements of the stated research questions, so as to ensure completeness. Five point Likert scale was used to generate the data for the analysis. The scale of 5(Strongly Agree), 4(Agree), 3(Undecided) 2(Strongly Disagree), 1(Disagree) was used. The use of scaled-responses was informed because it permits the measurement of intensity of respondents answers, compared to multiple choice responses (McDaniel & Gates, 2001). The questionnaire was structured into two sections with the first section eliciting the personal information of the respondents while the second section covers questions related to the research objectives.

Validity of the Instrument

The researcher used face and content validity in this research work. To ensure instrument validity, experts from the department reviewed the contents of the questionnaire. Their corrections and suggestions were incorporated into the final draft of the questionnaire. According to Coldwell and Herbst (2004), using a panel of experts familiar with the content is one of the ways in which content validity can be established. The questionnaire is attached as an appendix to this work.

Reliability of the Instrument

To ensure consistency of the developed instrument, the instrument a pilot study was done using random sample of 10 customers. The number 10 was chosen for pre-test because according to Kathuri and Pals (1993), 10 is the smallest number that yields meaningful results on data analysis in a survey research. The researcher tested the reliability of the instrument by using of Cronbach alpha method. This method is appropriate since it involved a single administration of the instrument therefore it is expected to yield a greater internal consistency. The research instrument is reliable since the reliability coefficient is between 0.7 and 0.8 (Coldwell & Herbst, 2004).

Participants



the demographic features of the respondents such as gender and educational qualification are presented and analyzed.

Table 4.1 Frequencies and Percentages of the Gender Variables

Variables		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Male	199	60.86	60.9	60.9
Gender	Female	128	39.14	39.1	100.0
	Total	327	100.0	100.0	

Source: Field Survey, 2023.

The table above depicts the sex of the commuters covered in this study. 199 respondents representing 60.9% were male while 128 respondents representing 39.1% were female. There are more male commuters than the female commuters within the period under review.

Table 4.4 Educational Qualification



Variable		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	O'Level	42	12.8	12.8	12.8
Educational	OND/NCE	130	39.75	39.8	52.6
qualification	B.Sc/HND	114	34.86	34.9	87.5
	MSC/MBA	25	7.6	7.6	95.1
	PhD/Others	16	4.89	4.9	100.0
	Total	327	99.9	100.0	

Source: Field Survey, 2023.

Table 4.4 above shows the educational qualifications of the respondents. The table indicates that 12.8% of the respondents have O'level as their educational qualification, 39.8% of the respondents are OND/NCE holders, 34.9% of the respondents are B.Sc./HND holders 7.6% of be respondents have M.Sc./MBA, while 4.9% of the respondents have PhD and others as their educational qualification.

Results



Table 4.5 Respondents opinion on the Influence of reliability on commuter satisfaction

Reliability	SA	A	UD	D	SD	Total
Service provider upholds its promises to the customer: punctuality, route destination	120 (36.7)	126 (38.6)	40 (12.2)	28 (8.6)	13 (3.9)	327 (100)
The staff of the transport firms are honest and reliable	101 (30.9)	115 (35.2)	51 (15.6)	49 (14.9)	11 (3.4)	327 (100)
The staff shows sincere interest in solving problems	110 (33.6)	91 (27.8)	47 (14.4)	61 (18.7)	18 (5.5)	327 (100)
Standard services are delivered every time per use.	94 (28.7)	125 (38.3)	39 (11.9)	50 (15.3)	19 (5.8)	327 (100)
They get to their destination at the time they promise	52 (15.9)	105 (32.1)	61 (18.7)	74 (22.6)	35 (10.7)	327 (100)
Staffs always keep passengers informed about when the buses will arrive and depart	100 (30.6)	114 (34.9)	50 (15.2)	30 (9.2)	33 (10.1)	327 (100)

Source: field survey 2023.

Table 4.5 revealed that 120 respondents representing 36.7% strongly agreed that the service provider upholds its promises to the customer: punctuality, route destination, 126 respondents representing 38.6 % agreed, while 40 respondents representing 12.2% were undecided. The table further shows that 28 respondents representing 8.6% disagreed while 13 respondents representing 3.9% strongly disagreed. The table also revealed that 101 respondents representing 30.9% strongly agreed that the staff of the transport firms is honest and reliable, 115 respondents representing 35.2 % agreed, while 51 respondents representing 15.6 % were undecided. The table further shows that 49 respondents representing 14.9% disagreed while 11 respondents representing 3.4% strongly disagreed. The table further revealed that 110



respondents representing 33.6% strongly agreed that the staff show sincere interest in solving problems, 91 respondents representing 27.8% agreed, while 47 respondents representing 14.4% were undecided. The table further shows that 61 respondents representing 18.7% disagreed while 18 respondents representing 5.5% strongly disagreed. Furthermore, the table revealed that 94 respondents representing 28.7% strongly agreed that standard services are delivered every time per use. 125 respondents representing 38.3% agreed, while 39 respondents representing 11.9% were undecided. The table further shows that 50 respondents representing 15.3% disagreed while 19 respondents representing 5.8% strongly disagreed. Going further the table revealed that 52 respondents representing 15.9% strongly agreed that the service provider get to their destination at the time they promise 105 respondents representing 32.1% agreed, while 61 respondents representing 18.7% were undecided. The table further shows that 74 respondents representing 22.6% disagreed while 35 respondents representing 10.7% strongly disagreed.

Lastly the table revealed that 100 respondents representing 30.6% strongly agreed that the Staffs always keep passengers informed about when the buses will arrive and depart, 114 respondents representing 34.9% agreed, while 50 respondents representing 15.2% were undecided. The table further shows that 30 respondents representing 9.2% disagreed while 33 respondents representing 10.1% strongly disagreed.



Table 4.7 Respondents opinion on the influence of responsiveness on commuter satisfaction

Responsiveness	SA	A	UD	D	SD	Total
Quick service at time of ticket booking	131	138	18	25	15	327
	(40.1)	(42.2)	(5.5)	(7.6)	(4.6)	(100)
The staff look pleased and enthusiastic in service	113	147	31	10	26	327
	(34.5)	(45.0)	(9.5)	(3.0)	(8.0)	(100)
The staff is never too busy to respond to passengers request	121	171	15	13	7	327
	(37.0)	(52.3)	(4.6)	(4.0)	(2.1)	(100)
The staff provide details about their process and routes	126	160	16	17	8	327
	(38.5)	(49.0)	(4.8)	(5.2)	(2.5)	(100)
Passengers don't have to wait too long before departure	98	160	35	23	11	327
	(30.0)	(49.0)	(10.7)	(7.0)	(3.3)	(100)
The staff tells the customer exactly when buses will be available and when they will depart	118	166	15	20	8	327
	(36.1)	(50.8)	(4.6)	(6.1)	(2.4)	(100)

Source: field survey 2023.

Table 4.7 revealed that 131 respondents representing 40.1% strongly agreed that quick service is offered at time of ticket booking, 138 respondents representing 42.2 % agreed, while 18 respondents representing 5.5% were undecided. The table further shows that 25 respondents representing 7.6% disagreed while 15 respondents representing 4.6% strongly disagreed. The table also revealed that 113 respondents representing 34.5% strongly agreed that the staff look pleased and enthusiastic in service, 147 respondents representing 45.0 % agreed, while 31 respondents representing 9.5 % were undecided. The table further shows that 10 respondents



representing 3.0% disagreed while 26 respondents representing 8.0% strongly disagreed. The table further revealed that 121 respondents representing 37.0% strongly agreed that the staff is never too busy to respond to passengers' request, 171 respondents representing 52.3% agreed, while 15 respondents representing 4.6% were undecided. The table further shows that 13 respondents representing 4.0% disagreed while 7 respondents representing 2.1% strongly disagreed. Furthermore, the table revealed that 126 respondents representing 38.5% strongly agreed that the staff provide details about their process and routes. 160 respondents representing 49.0 % agreed, while 16 respondents representing 4.8% were undecided. The table further shows that 17 respondents representing 5.2% disagreed while 8 respondents representing 2.5% strongly disagreed. Going further the table revealed that 98 respondents representing 30.0% strongly agreed that the passengers don't have to wait too long before departure. 160 respondents representing 49.0% agreed, while 35 respondents representing 10.7% were undecided. The table further shows that 23 respondents representing 7.0% disagreed while 11 respondents representing 3.3% strongly disagreed. Lastly the table revealed that 118 respondents representing 36.1% strongly agreed that the staff tells the customer exactly when buses will be available and when they will depart, 166 respondents representing 50.8% agreed, while 15 respondents representing 4.6% were undecided. The table further shows that 20 respondents representing 6.1% disagreed while 8 respondents representing 2.4% strongly disagreed.

Test of Hypotheses

The hypotheses, formulated to guide this study were empirically tested using the t-statistics values and the probability values in the coefficients of the multiple regression analysis.

Table 4.14 Coefficients of the Multiple Regression

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Significant
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	25.006	1.717		14.564	.000
REL	.093	.039	.076	3.372	.001



RES	.072	.043	.093	2.671	.006
-----	------	------	------	-------	------

Dependent Variable:Commuter satisfaction

Source: SPSS, Version 21.0

Hypothesis One

Ho: Reliability has no significant effect on commuter satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra State.

H₁: Reliability has a significant effect on commuter satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra State.

Reliability has a t-statistics value of 3.372 with a probability value of 0.001 which is statistically significant. Therefore, we reject the null hypothesis and accept the alternative hypothesis and conclude that reliability has a significant effect on commuter satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra State.

Hypothesis Two

Ho: Responsiveness has no significant effect on commuter satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra State

H₁: Responsiveness has a significant effect on commuter satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra State.

Responsiveness has a t-statistics value of 2.671 with a probability value of 0.006 which is statistically significant. Therefore, we reject the null hypothesis and accept the alternative hypothesis and conclude that responsiveness has a significant effect on commuter satisfaction in transportation firms in Anambra State.

Discussion of Findings



This work examined the influence of service quality dimensions of reliability and responsiveness on commuters' satisfaction of transportation firms' services in Anambra state, Nigeria. Data were sourced from customers of five selected transport companies. The data generated were analyzed using linear regression analysis. The study found that reliability has a significant effect on commuter satisfaction in road transportation firms in Anambra State. This agrees with the findings of Ueasangkomsate P (2019) that service expectations exceed perceptions regarding the quality of reliability in on demand riders. The study further found that responsiveness has a significant influence on commuter satisfaction in road transportation firms in Anambra State. This agrees with the findings of Helon, and Ejem (2021) that consumers have significant positive satisfaction in respect of responsiveness to the transport firms in Nigeria. In summary, the findings of this study include

1. Reliability has a significant positive influence on commuters' satisfaction in road transportation firms in Anambra State.
2. Responsiveness has a significant positive influence on commuters' satisfaction in road transportation firms in Anambra State.

Conclusion

The study concludes that service quality variables have significant positive effect on commuters' satisfaction in road transportation firms in Anambra State. This conclusion is supported by significant statistics which measures collective significant of the effect of the explanatory variables on the dependent variable. Therefore, the service quality variables (reliability and responsiveness) can collectively explain the variations in commuter satisfactions of road transportation firms in Anambra State.

Recommendations

The study recommends the following:

1. There is need to provide more training to the employee of the transport firm especially those that have direct contact with the commuters at the terminals to enhance their customer service skills. The training should focus on employees' ability to help customers resolve their queries and problems quickly.



2. Also, in the process of resolving commuters' problems, they should show a caring, courteous attitude and a sincere interest in helping travellers.
3. Furthermore, transport firms should improve their knowledge and skills so that they can provide a fast and reliable service to their customers. When they promise to do something for the customer within a certain time, they must fulfill that promise.
4. Also, employees of the transport firms should provide spontaneous care and concern for passengers, collaborating with other travel related partners (eg, car rental, hotels, travel insurance) in order to provide effective services to the customers.
5. Transport firms should also seek to develop strategies that enhance positive behavioral intentions. These strategies should include meeting and exceeding customers' desired service levels, dealing effectively with dissatisfied customers, and confronting customer complaints positively.

Contribution to Knowledge

The major contribution of this study to knowledge is that it established that service quality variables have significant effect on commuter satisfaction of road transportation firms' services in Anambra state. The study also provides empirical evidence that can aid transport companies and policy formulators in understanding the effect of service quality on commuter satisfaction of road transportation firms' services in Anambra state.

Transport Service Providers: The findings generated via this study would be of value to the transport service providers in the Anambra state. It will also be of immeasurable use to transport providers in other states. The findings will help to understand clearly how customers perceive the quality of services they render. This will aid them in improving the quality of services they provide.

Transport Managers: This study will help to identify the relationship between service quality dimensions (reliability, assurance, tangibility, empathy and responsiveness) and consumer satisfaction. These factors can be used by management of these transport companies to measure and improve the quality of services they render. This study will also be of great use to transport managers in providing a direction on how to modify and improve on their existing service



quality. It is expected that the findings will be compelling enough to lead management to commit the necessary resources to improve the quality of their services.

Customers: This study will help customers to understand the influence on service quality needed by transport companies on them. It will help to identify loopholes in transport service and how to demand for improvement.

Researchers/Academicians: This study is expected to expand the frontiers of knowledge with respect to how service quality dimension and consumer satisfaction. This study will provide empirical and theoretical footings for further researcher works Researchers who intend carrying out further research on service quality in transport sector or any other sector will benefit immensely from this study.

The following are suggested for further studies:

1. Similar studies should be replicated in the airline sector in Anambra state.
2. Service quality variables should be examined in relation to customer satisfaction and loyalty in online booking rider services Anambra state.
3. More transport firms should be used to examine the influence of service quality variables on commuter satisfaction of transport firms' services.

Limitations of the Study

In a bid to achieve the objective of this study, the research will encounter some challenges. Inaccessibility of all the empirical and theoretical literatures especially within the context may constitute a major challenge. Thus, limited literature related to service quality dimensions and commuter satisfactions were examined. Also, the sample of respondents can be seen as limitation of this study because it may be limited by the number of respondents who successfully completed the questionnaire. Similarly, the chosen sample (consumers of five transport companies) may limit the generalization of the findings of this to all the transport companies in Anambra State. Finally, we believe some persons may be uncooperative which may affect the quality of response obtained from them. Despite these limitations, the researcher will make effort to minimize their negative impact by utilizing validated research instrument and by appealing to the respondents on the need for this research work.



References

- Agbor, J.M. (2011) Relationship between customer satisfaction and services quality. a study of three service sectors in Lemea. *Umea School of Business, Umea University, Umeå, 1-92.*
- Agyeman S., Cheng L. (2020). Analysis of barriers to perceived service quality in Ghana: Students' perspectives on bus mobility attributes. *Transport Policy, Vol 99, Pages 63-85.*
- Akbar, M. & Parvez, N. (2005). Impact of service quality, trust and customer satisfaction engender customers loyalty, *ABAC Journal*21(9) 24-38.
- Alabar, T. T., Ode, E. & Gbande, R. L. (2014). Service quality and customer satisfaction in Nigerian mobile telephony, *3rd International Conference on Business, Management and Governance, Singapore.*
- Andaleeb, S. S. & Coway, C. (2006). Customer satisfaction in the restaurant industry: An examination of the transaction-specific model. *Journal of Services Marketing, 2001), 3-11.*
- Archana, R., & Subha, M. V. (2012). A study on service quality and passenger satisfaction on Indian airlines. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research* 2(2) 50-63.
- Ariral, C. (2012). An exploration of international bus service quality: A study of Thai-Laos routes. *1st Mae Fah Lung University International Conference.*
- Arizon, V. (2010). Service quality delivery in the food and beverage service, CPUT Theses & Dissertations.



- Baker, D. M. A. (2013). Service quality and customer satisfaction in the airline industry. A comparison between legacy airlines and low-cost airlines. *American Journal of Tourism Research*, 2(1), 67-7.
- Banerjee, S. P., Saha, S., Jain, D., & Rao, S. (2020) Measuring service quality of on demand ride services. *International Journal of Management (IJM) Volume 11, Issue 10, pp. 11-22.*
- Bapuuroh.C.B. (2021). The influence of service quality delivery on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty in the face of the banking crisis in Ghana. *European Journal of Business and Management.*
- Beatson, A., Lings, I., & Gudergan, S. (2008), Employee behavior and relationship quality: impact on customers. *The Service Industries Journal*, 28(2), 211-223.
- Bettercourt, L. A., & Gwinner, K. (1996). Customization of the service experience the role of the frontline employee *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 7(2), 3-20.
- Blery, E., Batistatos, N., Papastratou, E, Perifanos, L. Remoundaki, G., & Retina, M. (2009) Service quality and customer retention in mobile telephony, *Journal of Targeting Measurement and Analysis for Marketing*, 17(1), 27-37.
- Blose, J. E., & Tankersley, W. B. (2004) Linking dimensions of service quality to original outcomes. *Managing service quality*, 14(1), 75-89.
- Bolton, H. N., & Drew, J. (1991). A multistage model of customers' assessment of service and value. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 17(4), 375-384.
- Butler, G. F. & Keller, M. R. (1992). The cost-constrained global airline industry environment: What is quality? *Transportation Quarterly*, 46, 599-618.
- Buttle, F. (1996). SERVQUAL: Review, critique, research agenda *European Journal of Marketing*, 30(1), 8-32.
- Carmen, J. M. (1990). Consumer satisfactions of service quality an assessment of the SERVQUAL dimensions, *Journal of Retailing*, 66(1), 33-55.
- Cavana, R. Y., & Corbett, L. M. (2007). Developing zones tolerance for managing passenger rail service quality, *International Journal of Quality Reliability Management* 24: 7-31.
- Chang, Y., & Keller, M. R. (2002). A survey analysis of service quality for domestic airlines. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 139, 166-177.



- Chen, F., & Chang, Y. (2005). Examining airline service quality from a process perspective. *Journal of Air Transport Management*, 11, 79-87.
- Cirpin, B., & Sarica, A. (2014). Measurement of service quality in banking industry: A case study from Turkey. *Istanbul University of Journal of the School of Business*, 43(2), 205-217.
- Coldwell, D. and Herbst, F. J. (2004) Business research. - Juta Academic - New York.
- Cronin, J.J., Brady, M.K. & Hult, G.T.M (2000). Assessing the effects of quality, value and customer satisfaction on consumer behavioral intentions in service environment *Journal of Retailing*, 76(2), 193-218.
- Czepiel, J.A. (1990). Service encounters and service relations: Implications for research. *Journal of Business Research*, 20, 13-21.
- Dale, B. G. (2003). *Managing quality* 4th ed. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- DeSarbo, W.S. Jedidi, K., & Sinha, I. (2001). Customer value analysis in a heterogeneous market. *Strategic Management Journal* 22(9), 845-857.
- Eboli, L. & Mazzulia G., (2021) Customer Satisfaction as a measure of Service Quality in Public Transport planning. In: Vickerman, Roger (eds.) *International Encyclopedia of Transportation*. vol. 6, pp. 220-224.
- Ekinci, Y., Dawes, P.L. and Massey, G.R. (2008), "An extended model of the antecedents and consequences of consumer satisfaction for hospitality services", *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 42 No. 1/2, pp. 35-68.
- El-Sakty, K., & Goma, M. (2016). An empirical investigation of service quality impacts on passengers' satisfaction in air industry. *Researcher, Productivity & Quality Institute*, AASTMT, Cairo, Egypt.
- Enimola D. J., Egbu E. M. & Nafiu A. T. (2021) Analysis of public transport service quality and satisfaction of customers in Kogi state. *Lafia Journal of Economics and Management Sciences: Vol. 6, No. 1; Issue 1, 2021* ISSN: 2550-732X.
- Etuk A., Anyadighibe J.A., James E.E., and Mbaka R. (2021). Service quality & passengers' loyalty of public transportation companies. *British Journal of Management and Marketing Studies* ISSN: 2689-5072 Volume 4, Issue 4, (pp. 82-98).
- Gamba, M. K. K. (2013). Customer satisfaction of the effectiveness of service quality delivery of Islamic banks in Nigeria: An evaluation of Jaiz Bank. *Journal of Marketing and Consumer Research*, 1, 9-16.



- Ghazal, M., & Suchita, J. (2014). Assessing customer satisfaction of service quality: Comparative study of airlines in UAE. *World Review of Business Research* 4(2), 291-302
- Ghobadian, A. Speller, S. & Jones, M. (1994). Service quality concepts and models *International Journal of Quality & Reliability Management*, 11(9), 43-67.
- Gi, T. Y. Vinh, V. T., & Sae, Y. R. (2015). An analysis of part service quality and customer satisfaction: The case of Korean Container Ports. *The Asian Journal of Shipping and Logistics*, 31(4), 437-447.
- Gibert, D. & Wong, R. K. (2003) Passenger expectations and airline services a Hong Kong based study. *Tourism Management*, 24(5), 519-532.
- Gliatis, V.A. & Minis, I.E. (2007). Service attribute-process matrix; a tool for designing managing services, *Journal of Systems Science and Systems Engineering*, 16(3), 257-276
- Goldstein, S. M., Johnston, R., Duffy, I. & Raod, J. (2002). The service concept: The missing link in service design research? *Journal of Operations Management*. 20, 121-134.
- Gray, B. (2004). The relationships between service quality, customer satisfaction and buying intentions in the private hospital industry. *South African Journal of Business Management*, 35(4), 27-37.
- Gronroos, C. (2001). The perceived quality concept: A mistake? *Managing Service Quality*. 11(3), 3.
- Habibollah, R. K., Younes, J. & Ahmad, A. B. (2016). An analysis of the pro-social behaviors of customers in response to the firm' service quality. *Iranian Journal of Management Studies (IJMS)*, 9(1) 21-41.
- Har, K. K. L. (2008). Service dimensions of service quality impacting customer satisfaction of fine dining restaurants in Singapore. University of Nevada, Las Vegas.
- Helon, C.R. & Ejem, E.A., (2021) Road transport management and customer satisfaction in nigeria: a study of imo state transport company, Nigeria. *European Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Research*, Vol.9, No.2, pp.16-27.
- Horsu, E. N., & Yeboah, S. 1. (2015). Influence of service quality on customer satisfaction: A study of minicab taxi services in Cape Coast, Ghana. *International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management*, 11(5), 1451-1464.



- Husin, N. S. (2022). Factors influence passenger experience on ride-hailing transportation among young generation. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 12(12), 2711 – 2723.
- Iglesias, M. P., & Guillén, M. J. Y. (2004). Perceived quality and price: their impact on the satisfaction of restaurant customers. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 16(6), 373-379.
- Jaiswal, A. K. (2008). Customer satisfaction and service quality measurement in Indian call centres. *Managing Service Quality*, 18(4), 405-16
- Jayalath S.D.S. (2019). The relationship between service quality of sport event and customer satisfaction: A study of president's gold cup volleyball tournament -2017. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications* 9(9)
- Jhan, V., & Khan, K. (2008). Determinants of performance in retail banking: Perspectives of customer satisfaction. *Singapore Management Review*, 30(2), 35- 45.
- Jin Z, Schmöcker J., Maadi S., (2019). On the interaction between public transport demand, service quality and fare for social welfare optimization. *Research in Transportation Economics*, Vol 76.
- Julius, D. N. & Jatmika, D. (2019). The role of service quality on loyalty among low cost carrier consumers. *Jurnal Psibernetika*, 12(1), 39-43
- Juran, J.T.M. (1989). *Juran on Leadership by Design: The new step for planning quality into goods and services*. New York: Free Press.
- Kang, G. D., & James, J. (2004). Service quality dimensions: An examination of Gronroos's service quality model, *Managing Service Quality*, 14(4), 266-77.
- Kathuri, N.J., & Pals E. (1993). *Introduction to Education Research*. Njoro, Egerton University.
- Kenan, A., & Seda, Y (2012). The measurement of service quality with Servqual for different domestic airline firms in Turkey. *Serbian Journal of Management*. 7(2), 219-230.
- Kheng L Mahamad, O., Ramayah, T. Mosahabs, R. (2010). The impact of service quality on customer loyalty: a study of banks in penang, malaysia. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 2(2), 57-66.
- Kotler, P., Wong, V. Saunders, J., & Armstrong, G. (2003) . *Principles of marketing* London: Pearson Education.
- Kotler. P. (1999). *Marketing Management* Millennium edition. Indian: Prentice Hall.



- Kotler, P. Wong, V., Saunders, J. & Armstrong, G, (2005). Principles of marketing, 4th ed. England: Pearson Education.
- Lai, W.T. Chen, C.F. (2011). Behavioral intentions of public transit passengers: The role of service quality, perceived value, satisfaction and involvement. *Transport Policy*, 18(2), 318-325.
- Lee, Y. J., Chen, C. Y., Huang, C. L., Chang, L. Y., & Udomjarumane, K. (2009). A comparison of service quality perception in real estate brokerage between Taiwan and Thailand. *The Journal of International Management Studies*, 4(3), 10-24.
- Lehtinen, U. & Lelainen, J.R. (1982). Service quality: A study of quality dimensions, Unpublished Working Paper, Service Management Institute, Helsinki.
- Loverlock, C. H. Vandermerwe, S. Lewis B., & Fernie, S. (2011). *Service marketing* Edinburg: Edinburgh Business School.
- Luke., R., Heyns., G. (2020). An analysis of the quality of public transport in Johannesburg, South Africa using an adapted SERVQUAL model. *Transportation Research Procedia*, 48: 3562- 3576.
- Madumere H. I., Uche, & Agu G. A. (2020). Influence of perceived service quality on customer loyalty. *Quantitative Economics and Management Studies*, 2(2), 105–121.
- Malyadri, P., & Satyanarayana, P. (2014) Service quality satisfactions of domestic airline consumers in India: An empirical study *International Journal of Economics and Management Sciences*, 3, 189.
- Mane A., & Rajeshirke N. Y. (2017). The impact of internet on service quality and customer satisfaction: A comparative study of public sector and private sector banks in Pune city. *Asian Journal of Research in Banking and Finance*, 7(6), 32-50.
- Matzler, K., Fuchas, M., & Schubert, A.K. (2004). Employee satisfaction: Does Kano's model apply? *TQM and Business Excellence*, 15(9/10), 1179-1198.
- McCabe, D., Rosenbaum, M. S., & Yurchisin, J. (2007). Perceived service quality and shopping motivations: A dynamic relationship. *Services Marketing Quarterly*, 29 (1), 1-21.
- Mudie P. & Pirrie, A. (2006). *Services Marketing Management*. Routledge 3rd ed. London.
- Muthupandian, K S and Vijayakumar, C. (2012): Measurement of passenger's service quality in public transportation: servqual analysis. *Business Plus*, Vol. 1, No. 5 pp. 1-9.
- Nabi, N. (2012) Customer expectations of service quality: A study on private banks of Bangladesh. *World Review of Business Research* 2, 172-186.



- Ndubisi, N. O. (2006). A structural equation modeling of the antecedents of relationship quality in the Malaysia Banking Sector. *Journal of Financial Services Marketing* 11(2), 131-141.
- Njelita, C. I. & Anyasor, M.O. (2020). Customer loyalty and patronage of quick service restaurant in Nigeria. *British Journal of Marketing Studies*, 8(2), 54–76.
- Nurmahdi A. (2019). Customer Satisfaction Index for Transport Services. *International Journal of Economics and Business Administration*, Volume VII, Issue 1, 192-199.
- Nyeck, S., Morales, M., Ladhari, R., & Pons, F. (2002). 10 years of service quality measurement: Review of the use of the SERQUAL instrument. *Cuadernos de Diffusion*, 7 (13), 101- 107.
- Ojo, O. (2010). The relationship between service quality and customer satisfaction in the telecommunication industry: evidence from Nigeria. *Broad Research in Accounting, Negotiation, and Distribution, EduSoft . Vol. 1.2010, 1, p. 88-100.*
- Ok, S. and Hengsadeekul T. (2018). Customer satisfaction on service quality of bus transport: a survey of passengers from Phnom Penh to Poipet in Cambodia. *Journal of Social Science Studies ISSN 2329-9150, Vol. 5, No. 2.*
- Onyeagwara. C., O., Njelita, C. I., & Agu, A. G. (2022). Drivers of customer switching behaviour in the Nigerian road transport industry. Daengku: *Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Innovation*, 2(1), 68-84.
- Osaiga, F. I. & Onowe, E. O. (2014). Comparative study of service quality in Nigerian restaurant and transport business organizations. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 9(4), 151-159
- Osoimehin, K., Hassan, B. A., & Abass, H. A. (2015). *Journal of Economics and Business Research*. XXI(1), 144-157.
- Pakdil, F., & Aydin, O. (2007). Expectations and satisfactions in airline services An analysis using weighted SERVQUAL scores, *Journal of Air Transport Management*, 13(1), 123-134.
- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, LL. (1988), SERVQUAL: A multiple-item scale for measuring consumer satisfactions of service quality. *Journal of Retailing* 64, 12-40.
- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V., & Berry, L.L (1991). Refinement and reassessment of the SERVQUAL instrument *Journal of Retailing* 67(4).



- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V., & Berry, L. (1985). A conceptual model of service quality and its implications for future research. *Journal of Marketing*, 49, 41-50.
- Park, J.W., Robertson, R., & Wu, C. L. (2004). The effect of airline service quality on passenger's behavioral intentions: A Korean case study, *Journal of Air Transport Management*, 10, 435-439.
- Payne, A., & Holt, S. (2001) Diagnosing customer value integrating the value process and relationship marketing. *British Journal of Management*. 12(2), 159-182.
- Pin-Fenn, C. (2014). An evaluation of service quality, trust, and customer loyalty in home delivery services. *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 3(8), 99-108.
- Porter, S., & Claycomb, C. (2007). The influence of brand recognition on retail store image. *The Journal of Product and Brand Management*. 6(6), 373.
- Rabiul, I., Mohammed, S. C., Mohammad, S., & Saluddin, A. (2014). Measuring customer's satisfaction on bus transportation. *American Journal of Economics and Business Administration*, 6(1), 34-41.
- Ramya N., Kowsalya A., & Dharanipriya K., (2019) Service quality and its dimensions. *Research & Development EPRA International Journal of (IJRD) Vol, 4, 2.*
- Rasca S. & Saeed N., (2022) "Exploring the factors influencing the use of public transport by commuters living in networks of small cities and towns". *Travel Behaviour and Society*, vol. 28, pp. 249-263.
- Reeves, C. A., & Bednar, D. A. (1994). Defining quality Alternatives and implications. *Academy of Management Review*, 19(3), 419-445.
- Robert, N., Muller, S. & Purcell, D. (2018). Relationship marketing and customer loyalty: Application of the commitment-trust theory. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Personnel Management*, 23(12), 10-21
- Rust, R. T., & Chung, T. S. (2006). Marketing models of service and relationships. *Marketing Science*, 25(6), 560-580.
- Sabine, L., Ho, T.Q., & Mario, C. (2016). Logistics service quality. The case of Da Nang City, *Procedia Engineering*, 142, 123-129
- Salami, C.G.E., & Olannye. A. P. (2013). Customer satisfaction about the service quality in selected Banks in Asaba. *Journal of Research to International Business and Management*, 3(3), 119-127.



- Santhiyavalli, G. (2011). Customer's satisfaction of service quality of State Bank of India: A factor analysis. *International Journal of Management & Business Studies*, 1(3), 78-84.
- Saw, Y. Q., Dissanayake, D., Ali, F., & Bentotage, T. (2020). Passenger satisfaction towards metro infrastructures, facilities and services. *Transportation Research Procedia*, 48, 3980–3995.
- Shenoy G. V, Srivastava U. K, Sharma S. C. (2011). Quantitative techniques for managerial decisions new age international ltd. 3rd edition (English, Paperback) pg 226.
- Siew Phaik, L., Ayankunle, A. T., Hanisah, M. S. & Alan, G. D. (2011) Service quality and customer satisfaction in a telecommunication service provider. *A Paper presented at International Conference on Financial Management and Economics IPEDR vol.11, IACSIT Press, Singapore.*
- Sikder, S., Rana, M. M., & Polas, M. R. H. (2021). Service quality dimensions (servqual) and customer satisfaction towards motor ride-sharing services: evidence from Bangladesh. *Annals of Management and Organization Research*, 3(2), 97-113.
- Singh P., Vasudevan R., Fathihah N., Kee D.M.H. (2021). Service quality dimension and customers' satisfaction: an empirical study of tesco hypermarket in Malaysia. *Journal of Applied Business and International Management* 6(3):102-114.
- Singh, S. (2013). Positive service encounter. A tool for customer loyalty in retail. *Journal of Business Theory and Practice*, 1(2), 244-261.
- Spreng, R.A., & Mackoy, R.D. (1996). An empirical examination of a model of perceived service quality and satisfaction, *Journal of Retailing*. 72(2), 201-14.
- Swar, B.N., & Sahoo, P.K. (2012). Service quality public, private, and foreign Banks. *Journal of Indian Management*, 9(3), 43-51
- Syed, M. L., Daisy, M. H. K. & Saman, S. (2012). Service quality and rail transport in Pakistan: A passenger perspective. *World Applied Sciences Journal* 18(3), 361-369.
- Taran, A.M. (2022). Evaluating the level of the shuttle service quality at Al al-Bayt university campus using the SERVQUAL model. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning, Vol. 17, No. 6, pp. 1905-1915*
- Taylor, B.D., Miller, D., Ieki, H., & Fink, C (2008). Nature and/or nature? Analyzing the determinants of transit ridership across US urbanized areas *Transport Resources*, 43: 60-77.



- Teboul, J. (1991). *Managing Quality Dynamics*, London, UK: Prentice-Hall.
- Top, C., & Ali, B. J. (2021). Customer satisfaction in online meeting platforms: Impact of efficiency, fulfillment, system availability, and privacy. *Amazonia Investiga*, 10 (38), 70– 81.
- Ueasangkomsate P. (2019). Service quality of public road passenger transport in Thailand. *Kasetsart Journal of Social Sciences*.
- Van Doorn, J. &Verhoef, P.C., (2008). Critical incidents and the impact of satisfaction on customer share. *Journal of Marketing*, 72, 123-142.
- Vargo, S. L., &Lusch, R. F. (2008). Service-dominant logic Continuing the evolution. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 36(1), 1-10.
- Vinh, V. T., Gi T.Y. &Saeyon R. (2015). An analysis of port service quality and customer satisfaction: the case of Korean container ports. *Asian Journal of Shipping and Logistics* 31(4):437-447
- Wang, Y., Zhang, Z., Zhu, M., & Wang, H. (2020). The impact of service quality and customer satisfaction on re-use intention in urban rail transit in Tianjin, China. *SAGE Open*, 10(1), 1-10.
- Wilson, R., Zelthaml, G., Bitner, F. &Gremler, E. (2008). *Service marketing: Integrating customer focus across the firm*. Berkshire: McGraw-Hill Education.
- Yeh, Y. (2013). The impact of customer advocacy on customer perceived value. *Journal of Business and Retail Management Research (JBRMR)*, 8(1), 91-102
- Zahari W., Yusoff, W., Ismail, M., & Newell, G. (2008). Fm-servqual: a new approach of service quality measurement framework in local authorities. *Journal of Corporate Real Estate*, 10(2), 130-144.
- Zahroh, M. (2022). The influence of service quality and satisfaction of benefits on go-pay service user satisfaction. *International Journal Multidisciplinary Science*.
- Završnik, B., &Jerman, J. (2005). The importance of logistics service quality in a business-to-business market. *Management*, 11(1), 1-16.
- Zeithaml, V. A., &Bitner, M. J. (2001). *Services marketing: Integrating customer focus across the firms*. Boston: Tata-McGraw Hill
- Zeithaml, V. A., Parasuraman, A., & Berry, L. L (1990). *Delivering quality service: Balancing customer satisfactions and expectations*. New York, NY: The Free Press.



Zeithaml, V.A., Bitner, M., & Gremler, D. (2006). *Services marketing Integrating customer focus across the firm*. 4th ed. New York: McGraw-Hill Irwin.

Zikmund, W. G., Babin, B. J., Carr, J. C., & Griffin, M. (2013). *Business research methods*. cengage learning.

Zorgati I., Zorgati H. and Zaabi E. (2021). Public transportation and service quality management during the COVID-19 outbreak: A case study of Tunisia. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 19(3), 298-308.

LETTER OF INTRODUCTION

Department of Marketing,
Faculty of Management Sciences,
School of Post Graduate Studies,
NnamdiAzikiwe University,
Awka,



24th February, 2023

Dear Sir/Madam,

REQUEST TO COMPLETE QUESTIONNAIRE

I am a postgraduate student of the above department and institution, conducting research on the topic "The Influence of Service Quality On Commuter Satisfaction in Transportation Firms in Anambra State" in partial fulfillment for the award of Masters of Science in Marketing.

I will be glad if you help fill the attached questionnaires to enable me carry out this research work successfully. I assure you that your responses will be treated in confidence and used solely for this research. Thank you for your cooperation.

Yours sincerely

NjelitaChukwudi I.

QUESTIONNAIRE

Instruction: Please tick () to indicate your response to the question

Section A: Bio Data

1. Gender: Male () Female ()
2. Marital Status: Single () Married () Separated /Divorced ()
3. Age bracket: 20 - 30 years () 31- 40 years () 41 - 50 years ()
51 years and above ()



4. Educational Qualification: OND/NCE () B.Sc/HND ()
 MSC/MBA () PhD/Others ()

Section B: Data Relevant to the Research Objectives

Key:

SA Strongly Agree

A Agree

U Undecided

SD Strongly Disagree

D Disagree

S/N	Question	SA	A	UD	D	SD
	Reliability					
1	Service provider upholds its promises to the customer: punctuality, route destination etc.					
2	The staff of the transport firms are honest and reliable					
3	The staff shows sincere interest in solving problems					
4	Standard services are delivered every time per use.					
5	They get to their destination at the time they promise					
6	Staffs always keep passengers informed about when the buses will arrive and depart					
	Tangibility					
7	The physical condition of bus is maintained in "like new" condition					
8	The passenger seats are comfortable					
9	The cabin outlook visually appeals					



10	Modern facilities such as TV and toilet are in the terminal					
11	Service persons are neat in appearance and well-dressed					
12	The terminal has convenient access and car park					
	Responsiveness					
13	Quick service at time of ticket booking					
14	The staff look pleased and enthusiastic in service					
15	The staff is never too busy to respond to passengers request					
16	The staff provide details about their process and routes					
17	Passengers don't have to wait too long before departure					
18	The staff tells the customer exactly when buses will be available and when they will depart					
	Assurance					
19	Service provider maintain assurance for safety and property while traveling					
20	Staff maintain courteous, polite, humble relationship to customer in service all the time					
21	The staff is knowledgeable and can answer customer questions					
22	Staff are consistently courteous					
23	Behaviour of employees instills passengers confidence					
24	Customer always feel secure in transit with the service provider					
	Empathy					



25	Staff interested and educated in differences and limitations of each customer, such as the elderly, children, disabled people who require special services					
26	Provider understand the needs of the passenger and customer recognition as necessary					
27	Service provider maintain operating hours convenient to all their customer					
28	Service provider consider the benefit of customer is the most important					
29	Service provider always protects customer's interest and well-being					
30	Staff deals with passenger in a caring fashion and provide personal attention					
	Commuter satisfaction					
31	Commuter is satisfied that the service have delivered the expected function					
32	The services of the transport firms fulfill the customers need					
33	The overall quality of services provided is acceptable					
34	The service offered deviates from customer expectation					
35	The services provided is of high quality					
36	The various transportation attributes is satisfactory					



Variables Entered/Removed^a

Model	Variables Entered	Variable Removed	Method
1	Empathy, Assurance, Tangibility, Reliability, Responsiveness ^{SS}		Enter

a. Dependent Variable: Commuter satisfaction

b. All requested variables entered

Model Summary^b

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin-Watson
1	.128 ^a	.616	.571	3.232	1.932

a Predictors: (Constant), Empathy, Assurance, Tangibility, Reliability, Responsiveness

b. Dependent Variable: Commuter satisfaction

ANOVA^a

Model	Sum of Square	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1 Regression	56.005	5	11.201	123.072	.000
1 Residual	3353.469	321	10.447		
Total	3409.474	326			

a. Dependent Variable: Commuter satisfaction

b. Predictors: (Constant), Empathy, Assurance, Tangibility, Reliability, Responsiveness

Coefficients^a

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Significant
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	25.006	1.717		14.564	.000
1 REL	.093	.039		.076	.001
1 TAN	.029	.044		.037	.001



RES	.072	.043	.093	2.671	.006
ASS	.085	.045	.031	4.554	.000
EMP	.023	.041	.031	2.564	.003

a. Dependent Variable: Commuter Satisfaction

Residuals Statistics^a

	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation	N
Predicted Value	21.82	24.37	23.20	.414	327
Residual	-10.914	6.333	.000	3.207	327
Std. Predicted Value	-3.313	2.837	.000	1.000	327
Std. Residual	-3.377	1.959	.000	.992	327

a. Dependent Variable: Commuter Satisfaction

Correlations

	CP	REL	TAN	RES	ASS	EMP
Pearson Correlation	1	.774	.432	.688	.426	.529
CP Sig. (2-tailed)		.180	.681	.112	.635	.605
N	327	327	327	327	327	327
Pearson Correlation	.774	1	.068	.007	-.058	-.015
REL Sig. (2-tailed)	.000		.217	.905	.295	.361
N	327	327	327	327	327	327
Pearson Correlation	.423	.068	1	.100	.019	.040
TAN Sig. (2-tailed)	.001	.217		.071	.727	.473
N	327	327	327	327	327	327
Pearson Correlation	.688	.007	.100	1	.015	.079
RES Sig. (2-tailed)	.002	.905	.071		.792	.155
N	327	327	327	327	327	327
Pearson Correlation	.426	-.058	.019	.015	1	.021
ASS Sig. (2-tailed)	.005	.295	.727	.792		.707
N	327	327	327	327	327	327
Pearson Correlation	.529	-.051	.040	.079	.021	1



EMP Sig. (2-tailed)	.005	.361	.473	.155	.707	
N	327	327	327	327	327	327

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).